

The Remedial Herstory Project

INQUIRY-BASED LESSON PLAN

STAGING THE INQUIRY

For this inquiry, teachers should consider opening with an intriguing and open ended question, then provide some background on this topic generally in the form of a video, brief lecture, or presentation. Close the introduction by asking students what questions they have, guide them in discussion to the question for the inquiry, highlighted at the top of the next page.

ACTIVITY TASKS

- Pose a broad open ended question. Provide background information.
- Students respond to questions in this packet independently or with a partner.
- Consider doing one of the following to extend the exercise:
 - Facilitate student discussion of the compelling question.
 - Facilitate a 4-corner debate.
 - Facilitate a structured academic controversy.
 - Students assume the characters involved and discuss the compelling question in character.
- Students craft an argument.

C3 FRAMEWORK

D1.1.9-12. Explain how a question reflects an enduring issue in the field.

D1.2.9-12. Explain points of agreement and disagreement experts have about interpretations and applications of disciplinary concepts and ideas associated with a compelling question.

D2.His.4.9-12. Analyze complex and interacting factors that influenced the perspectives of people during different historical eras.

D2.His.5.9-12. Analyze how historical contexts shaped and continue to shape people's perspectives.

D2.His.10.9-12. Detect possible limitations in various kinds of historical evidence and differing secondary interpretations.

D2.His.11.9-12. Critique the usefulness of historical sources for a specific historical inquiry based on their maker, date, place of origin, intended audience, and purpose.

D2.His.12.9-12. Use questions generated about multiple historical sources to pursue further inquiry and investigate additional sources.

D2.His.14.9-12. Analyze multiple and complex causes and effects of events in the past.

D2.His.16.9-12. Integrate evidence from multiple relevant historical sources and interpretations into a reasoned argument about the past.

Inquiry Activity: Do Black men need the vote more than women?

In this inquiry students will examine contrasting primary source accounts and form their own conclusions.

Document A: Frederick Douglass on Women's Suffrage

Douglass was one of the few men and the only Black person present at the Seneca Falls Convention. He was a founding member of the Equal Rights Association and he gave this speech in 1888 reflecting on his experience.

Mrs. President, Ladies and Gentlemen: — I come to this platform with unusual diffidence. Although I have long been identified with the Woman's Suffrage movement, and have often spoken in its favor, I am somewhat at a loss to know what to say on this really great and uncommon occasion, where so much has been said.

When I look around on this assembly, and see the many able and eloquent women, full of the subject, ready to speak, and who only need the opportunity to impress this audience with their views... I do not feel like taking up more than a very small space of your time and attention, and shall not. **I would not, even now, presume to speak**, but for the circumstance of my early connection with the cause, and of having been called upon to do so... Men have very little business here as speakers, anyhow; and if they come here at all they should take back benches and wrap themselves in silence. For this is an International Council, not of men, but of women, and woman should have all the say in it. This is her day in court...

...When I ran away from slavery, it was for myself; when I advocated emancipation, it was for my people; but when I stood up for the rights of woman, self was out of the question, and I found a little nobility in the act.

...Man has been so long the king and woman the subject — man has been so long accustomed to command and woman to obey... thus has been piled up a mountain of iron against woman's enfranchisement.

The same thing confronted us in our conflicts with slavery... But neither the power of time nor the might of legislation has been able to keep life in that stupendous barbarism.

Sources: Frederick Douglass, Woman's Journal, April 14, 1888.

Source:

1. Why is Douglass an appropriate speaker at Seneca Falls and future Women's Rights Conventions?

Document

2. Why does Douglass think it is wrong that he is speaking at this event?
3. Does he think women's rights and slavery are the same? How so?

Document B: Divided Sisters

This book details the divisions over Reconstruction that pitted former allies of abolition and universal suffrage against each other and forced priorities. Susan B. Anthony was a prominent and passionate woman suffragist and abolitionist.

Frederick Douglass, at an 1866 meeting of the American Equal Rights Association. Their former ally appeared to back down from his earlier commitment to female suffrage, and was now saying that, while the ballot was "desirable" for women, it was "vital" for Black men. In response, Anthony declared, "I will cut off this right arm of mine before I will ever work or demand the ballot for the Negro and not the woman."

Wilson, Midge and Kathy Russel. *Divided Sisters: Bridging The Gap Between Black Women and White Women*. Anchor, 1996. Retrieved from

<https://condor.depaul.edu/mwilson/divided/chptone.html>.

Document C: Susan B. Anthony

In 1869 Anthony defended her position in favor of woman suffrage in her suffrage newspaper The Revolution.

The Revolution criticizes, 'opposes' the fifteenth amendment, not for what it is, but for what it is not. Not because it enfranchises black men, but because it does not enfranchise all women, black and white. It is not the little good it proposes, but the greater evil it perpetuates that we deprecate. It is not that in the abstract we do not rejoice that black men are to become equals of white men, but that we deplore the fact that two million (sic) black women, hitherto the political and social equals of the men by their side, are to become subjects, slaves of these men. Our protest is not that all men are lifted out of the degradation of disfranchisement, but that all women are left in. The Revolution and the National Women's Suffrage Association make women's suffrage their test of loyalty, not Negro suffrage, not Maine law or prohibition. Do you believe women should vote? Is the one and only question in our catechism.

Anthony, Susan B. *The Revolution*. October 7, 1869. Retrieved from Susan B. Anthony Birthplace Museum. <http://www.susanbanthonybirthplace.com/racism.html>.

Source:

1. Who is Susan B. Anthony?

Document:

2. Put her argument into your own words.

Analysis:

3. Do you interpret Anthony's comment to be elitist, anti-gradual enfranchisement, or racist? Why?

Document D: Sojourner Truth

Sojourner Truth escaped slavery and lived in Michigan. She changed her name to Sojourner Truth as a symbol of her freedom, Sojourner meaning a person who wanders. She became a powerful and outspoken voice for universal rights and suffrage. She delivered this speech at an Equal Rights Association convention in New York in 1867.

My friends, I am rejoiced that you are glad, but I don't know how you will feel when I get through. I come from another field- the country of the slave. They have got their liberty- so much good luck to have slavery partly destroyed; not entirely. I want it root and branch destroyed. Then we will all be free indeed. I feel that if I have to answer for the deeds done in my body just as much as man, I have a right to have as much as a man. **There is a great stir about colored men getting their rights, but not a word about the colored women; and if colored men get their rights, and not colored women theirs, you see the colored men will be masters over the women, and it will be just as bad as it was before.** So I am for keeping the thing going while things are stirring; because if we wait till it is still, it will take a great while to get it going again. White women are a great deal smarter, and know more than colored women, while colored women do not know scarcely anything. They go out washing, which is about as high as a colored woman gets, and their men go about idle, strutting up and down; and when the women come home, they ask for their money and take it all, and then scold you because there is no food. I want you to consider on that chil'n. I call you chil'n; you are somebody's chil'n, and I am old enough to be mother of all that is here. I want women to have their rights. In the courts women have no right, no voice; nobody speaks for them. I wish woman to have her voice there among the pettifoggers. If it is not a fit place for women, it us unfit for men to be there.

...I used to work in the field and bind grain, keeping up with the cradler, but men doing no more, got twice as much pay... You have been having our rights so long, that you think, like a slave-holder, that you own us... There ought to be equal rights now more than ever, since colored people have got their freedom.

Truth, Sojourner. "Address to the First Annual Meeting of the American Equal Rights Association." New York City, May 9, 1867. Retrieved from Society for the Study of American Women Writers. Harriet Jacobs, Ed.

<https://www.lehigh.edu/~dek7/SSAWW/writTruthAddress.htm>.

Source

1. Why would Truth be an appropriate speaker at an ERA convention and future Women's Rights Conventions?

Document

2. Does she think women's rights and slavery are the same? How so?

Analysis

3. How is Truth's message different than Douglass, or are they the same?

Document E: Elizabeth Cady Stanton “Manhood Suffrage”

During the debates over the 15th Amendment, Stanton published these comments in the suffrage newspaper The Revolution. Some historians have argued that she was attempting to use male logic against them.

“Think of Patrick and Sambo [derogatory, meaning mixed-race] and Hans and Yung Tung who do not know the difference between a Monarchy and a Republic, who never read the Declaration of Independence or Webster’s spelling book, making laws for Lydia Maria Child, Lucretia Mott or Fanny Kemble. Think of jurors drawn from these ranks to try young girls for the crime of infanticide.”

Stanton, Elizabeth Cady. “Manhood Suffrage.” *The Revolution*. Retrieved from Susan B. Anthony Birthplace Museum.
<http://www.susanbathonybirthplace.com/racism.html>.

Analysis:

1. Do you interpret Stanton’s comment to be elitist, anti-gradual enfranchisement, or racist? Why?

Document F: Minutes from the American Equal Rights Association Convention, 1869

Tensions were high in 1869 as debates over the 15th Amendment raged. Women felt abandoned in the quest for Universal Suffrage. The following are minutes from a debate in the ERA convention.

Mr. Foster: - ...I admire our talented president with all my heart, and love the woman. (Great laughter.) but I believe she has publicly repudiated the principles of the society.

Mrs. Stanton: - I would like Mr. Foster to say in what way.

Mr. Foster: - what are these principles? The equality of men – universal suffrage. These ladies stand **at the head of a paper which has adopted its motto educated suffrage**. I put myself on this platform as an enemy of educated suffrage, as an enemy of white suffrage, as an enemy of man suffrage, as an enemy of any kind of suffrage except universal suffrage. *The Revolution* lately had an article headed “That Infamous 15th Amendment.” ... The Massachusetts Abolitionists **cannot cooperate with the society as it is now organized**. If you choose to put officers here that ridicule the Negro, and pronounce the amendment infamous, why... I cannot work with you...

Henry B. Blackwell said:- In regard to the criticisms of our officers, I will agree that many unwise things have been written in *The Revolution* by a gentleman who furnished part of the means by which that paper has been carried on. But that gentleman has withdrawn and you, who know the real opinions of Miss Anthony and Mrs. Stanton on the questions of Negro Suffrage, do not believe that they mean to create antagonism between the Negro and the woman question. If they did disbelieve in Negro suffrage, it would be no reason for excluding them... But **I know that Miss. Anthony and Mrs. Stanton believe in the right of the Negro to vote...**

Mr. Douglass: – I came here more as a listener than to speak, and I have listened with a great deal of pleasure to the eloquent address... there is no name greater than that of Elizabeth Caddy Stanton in the matter of women’s rights and equal rights, but **my sentiments are tinged a little against *The Revolution***. There was in the address to which I allude the employment of certain names such as “Sambo,” [derogatory, meaning mixed-race] and the gardener, and the boot black, and the daughters of Jefferson and Washington, and all the rest that I cannot coincide with. I have asked what difference there is between the daughters of Jefferson and Washington and other daughters. (Laughter.) I must say that I do not see how anyone can pretend that there is the same urgency and giving the ballot to woman as to the Negro. **With us, the matter is a question of life and death, at least, and 15 states of the union. When women, because they are women, are hunted down** through the cities of New York and New Orleans; when they are drag from their houses and hung up on lamp-posts; when their children are torn from their arms, and their brains dashed out upon the pavement; when they are objects of insult and outraged at every turn; When they are in danger of having their homes burnt down over their heads; when their children are not allowed to enter schools; then they will have an urgency to obtain the ballot equal to our own. (Great applause.)

A VOICE:-is that not all true about black women?

Mr. Douglass: – **yes, yes, yes; it is true of the black woman, but not because she is a woman, but because she is black.** (Applause.) Julia Ward Howe at the conclusion of her great speech delivered at the convention in Boston last year, said: “I am willing that the Negro shall get the ballot before me.” (Applause.) Woman! Why, she has 10,000 modes of grappling with her difficulties. I believe that all the virtue of the world can take care of all the evil. I believe that all the intelligence can take care of all the ignorance. (Applause.) I am in favor of women’s suffrage in order that we shall have all the virtue and vice confronted. Let me tell you that when there were a few houses in which the black man could have put his head, this woolly head of mine found a refuge in the house of Miss Elizabeth Caddy Stanton, and if I had been blacker than 16 midnights, without a single star, it would have been the same. (Applause.)

Miss Anthony: – **the old anti-slavery school says women must stand back and wait until the Negroes shall be recognized. But we say, if you will not give the whole loaf of suffrage to the entire people, give it to the most intelligent first.** (Applause.) if intelligence, justice, and morality are to have precedence in the Government, let the question of woman be brought up first and that of the Negro last. (Applause.) while I was canvassing the state with petitions and had them filled with names for our cause to the legislature, a man dared to say to me that the freedom of women was all a theory and not a practical thing. (Applause.) when Mr. Douglass mentioned the black man first and the woman last, if he had noticed he would have seen that it was the men that clapped and not the women. There is not the woman born who desires to eat the bread of dependence no matter whether it be from the hand of the father, husband, or brother; for anyone who does so eat her bread places herself in the power of the person from whom she takes it. (Applause.) Mr. Douglass talks about the wrongs of the Negro; but

with all the outrageous that he to-day suffers, he would not exchange his sex and take the place of Elizabeth Caddy Stanton. (Laughter and applause.)

Mr. Douglass: – I want to know if granting you the right of suffrage will change the nature of our sexes? (Great laughter.)

Miss Anthony: – it will change the pecuniary position of a woman; it will place her where she can earn her own bread. (Loud applause.) She will not then be driven to such employment only as man chooses for her.

Mrs. Norton said that Mr. Douglass' remarks left her to defend the government from the inferred inability to grapple with the two questions at once. It legislate upon many questions at one and at the same time, it has the power to decide the woman question and the Negro question at one and the same time. (Applause.)

Mrs. Lucy Stone: – Mrs. Stanton will, of course, advocate for the presidents for her sex, and Mr. Douglass will strive for the first position for his, and both are perhaps right. If it be true that the government derives its authority from the constant of the governed, we are safe in trusting that principle to the other most. If one has a right to say that you can not read and therefore cannot vote, then it may be said that you are a woman and therefore cannot vote. We are lost if we turn away from the middle principle and argue for one class. I was once a teacher among fugitive slaves. There was one old man, and every tooth was gone, his hair was white, and his face was full of wrinkles, yet, day after day and hour after hour, he came up to the school house and tried with patients to learn to read, and by-and-by, when he had spelled out the first few verses of the first chapter of the gospel of St. John, he said to me, "now, I want to learn to write." I tried to make him satisfied with what he had acquired, but the old man said, "Mrs. Stone, somewhere in the wide world I have A son; I have not heard from him in 20 years; if I should hear from him, I want to write to him, so to take hold of my hand and teach me." I did, but before he had preceded in many lessons the angels came and gathered him up and bore him to his Father. Let no man speak of an educated Suffrage. The gentleman who addressed you claimed that the Negroes had the first right to the suffrage, and drew a picture which only his great word Dash power can do. He again in Massachusetts, when it had cast a majority in favor of Grant and Negro Suffrage, stood up on the platform and said that women had better wait for the Negro; that is, that both could not be carried, and that the Negro had better be the one. But I freely for gave him because he felt as he spoke. But woman suffrage is more imperative than his own; and I want to remind the audience that when he says what the Ku Klux's is dead all over the south, the Ku Klux Klan is here and the north in the shape of men, take away the children from the mother, and separate them as completely as if done on the block of the auctioneer. Over in New Jersey they have a law which says that any father – he might be the most brutal man that ever existed – any father, it says, whether he be under the age or not, maybe by his last, will and testament dispose of the custody of his child, born or to be born, and that such a disposition shall be good against all persons, and that the mother may not recover her child; and that law modified inform exists over every state in the union except in Kansas. Woman has an ocean of wrongs too deep for any plummet, and the Negro, too, has an ocean of wrongs that cannot be fathomed. There are two great

oceans; in the one is the black man, and the other is the woman. But I think God for that XV. Amendment, and hope that it will be adopted in every state. I will be thankful in my soul if anybody can get out of the terrible pit. But I believe that the safety of the government would be more promoted by the admission of woman as an element of restoration in harmony than the Negro. I believe that the influence of woman will save the country before every other power. (Applause.) I see the signs of the times pointing to this consummation, and I believe that in some parts of the country women will vote for the President of the United States in 1872. (Applause.)

Buhle, Mari Jo and Paul Buhle. "The Concise History of Woman Suffrage." Chicago, University of Illinois Press, 2005.

Source:

1. Are minutes from a meeting a reliable primary source?

Document:

2. For what reason does Stephen Foster want Susan B. Anthony and Elizabeth Cady Stanton to resign the American Equal Rights Association?
3. For what reason does Douglass take offense to *The Revolution*?
4. Why does Douglass argue Black men need the vote first?
5. Why does Anthony argue educated women need the vote first?
6. Why does Douglass believe Stanton is NOT racist?
7. Mrs. Norton and Lucy Stone make alternative arguments, describe them in your own words.

Analysis

8. Look back through the document. At what did audience members laugh? Why?
9. Can laughter be a sign of a bit of tongue-in-cheek? Or do you think prejudice is on display here?

